

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarificaiton	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
------	----------------	----------	--	---	----------------------------

Submitted by : Knight Frank

1	General			<p>1. The Letter No. URC/232/24/RFP/2017-18 dated 18-05-2017 on point no. 12 states that maximum 16 cities will be provided to on consultant (firm) In all there are 61 cities/towns, hence awarding 16 to one consultant would still leave 13 cities/towns unawarded. Kindly relook at the numbers.</p>	No Changes
2	General			<p>2. The Letter No. URC/232/24/RFP/2017-18 dated 18-05-2017 on point no. 11 states the consultant have to submit one Technical and 61 Financial Proposals. We feel that this may result in different consulting firms working in cities towns next to each other and this may not be operationally/ logistically a good proposition. We suggest that the 61 towns may kindly be divided into three geographic regions each containing approximately 20 cities/towns and then Technical and Financial Bids are invited for each region separately.</p>	No Changes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
3	General			<p>3. As per clause 7.3.4 the consultants are required to propose separate teams for carrying out the assignment considering one team for each city. This would mean providing 61 Team Leaders, 61 Urban Taxation Experts, 61 Urban Planners, and 61 Legal Experts. Kindly confirm if we are right in our understanding. If so, we would like to put forward that bringing such a large contingent of professionals would be very difficult for any of the three short-listed firms. We therefore would request the client to consider breaking the assignment into packages which can be handled properly.</p>	No Changes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
------	----------------	----------	--	---	----------------------------

Submitted by: CRISIL

1	Section 1. Letter of Invitation Page 2		Annexure I: List of Cities 39. Lucknow	The list includes the city of Lucknow. However, the RFP for providing “Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development” of Lucknow was released on 12th April, and the bids for the same have already been opened. We request the Authority to please delete Lucknow from the list.	39 Lucknow, 01 Agra (RFP Floated) to be excluded from the RFP
2	Section 2. Instructions to Consultants Page 4		9. Bidder has to submit Tender processing fee Non Refundable will Rs 5000/- INR (Five Thousand only) per Tender with 1st Inner Envelope with the Technical Proposal	We understand that we need to submit only ONE DD of amount INR 5000/- as part of Technical Proposal. Please confirm	Tender processing fee of INR 5,000 for per tender.

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
3	Standard Form of Contract		I. Form of Contract Name of the Client- Municipal Corporation ... (City)	The Form of Contract mentions the name of Client as Municipal Corporation of a city. In this regard, we would request the Authority to have all Contract signed by RCUES as a single contract and payment released per city depending in progress. This will lead to better control on the assignment. Also other states are taking this route wherein the contract is signed by the coordinating nodal agency.	No Changes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
----------------	---	---

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
4	<p align="center">Section 7. Terms of Reference Page 51</p> <p align="center">Section 8. Standard form of Contract Page 90</p>		<p>75. Outputs and deliverables</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · Inception report- 1 week from the date of commencement of assignment · Draft Report 1- 10 weeks from the date of commencement of assignment · Draft Report 2- 11 weeks from the date of commencement of assignment · Final Report- 12 weeks from the date of commencement of assignment <p>41.2. Payment arrangement</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · 10% - on submission of Inception report to State government, ULBs, and approval by State Govt. · 30% - on submission of Second Interim 	<p>The payment milestones mentioned in the Standard form of Contract do not match with the reports/ deliverables mentioned in the TOR. We would request the Authority to kindly clarify as to how the payment milestones would be distributed.</p> <p>We request Authority to consider the following payment schedule:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · 10% - on submission of Inception report to State government /ULBs, and approval by State Govt. · 30% - on submission of Draft Report 1 to State government, ULBs, and approval by State Government. · 40% - on submission of Draft Report 2 to State government, ULBs, and approval by State Govt. · 20% - on upon successful completion of handholding period and acceptance by State Govt. 	<p>41.2. Payment arrangement</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · 10% - on submission of Inception report to State government, ULBs, and approval by State Govt. · 30% - on submission of Draft Report- I to State government, ULBs, and approval by State Government. · 40% - on submission of Draft Report - 2 to State government, ULBs, and approval by State Govt. · 20%- on upon successful completion of handholding period and acceptance by State Govt.

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
----------------	---	---

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
------	----------------	----------	--	---	----------------------------

Submitted by: DELOITTE

1	Section 1: Letter of Invitation Serial Number 11. Page 15 of the RfP		Only One Technical proposal will be submitted for all 61 cities, while financial proposal will be submitted for each city separately.	We understand that a single technical proposal shall be submitted for all 61 cities. We also understand that a single team of key experts shall be proposed. Kindly confirm our understanding.	Separate teams to be depute for different cities once the contract will awarded for each cities. however for technical proposal only one team will considered for evaluation.
2	Section 1: Letter of Invitation Serial Number 12. Page 15 of the RfP		The final assignment of particular city among the 61 cities to the firm will be decided by the tender committee. Maximum sixteen cities will be provided to one Consultant (firm).	We understand that there are three empaneled firms. With a maximum of 16 cities for each consultant, only 48 cities shall be awarded. Kindly clarify the bidding mechanism for remaining 13 cities.	No Changes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
3	Section 1: Letter of Invitation Serial Number 12. Page 15 of the RfP		Method of selection is based on Quality and Cost based Selection (QCBS) and only the Financial Proposal of the technically top-ranked Consultant is opened by the evaluation committee shall be carried out for each city separately.	We understand that Financial Proposal of only the top-ranked Consultant shall be evaluated. If only technically top-ranked consultant's Financial Proposal will be opened, please specify what would be the basis of awarding the cities. Will the topranked consultant be able to choose the 16 cities at the price quoted in the Financial Proposal. If not then how would the cities be assigned to different consultants?	No Changes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
4	Section 2: Instructions to Consultants and Data Sheet A. General Provisions 3.c Conflicting Relationship Page 9		Relationship with the Client's staff: a Consultant (including its Experts and Sub-consultants) that has a close business or family relationship with a professional staff of the Client, or of implementing agency who are directly or indirectly involved in any part of (i) the preparation of the Terms of Reference for the assignment, (ii) the selection process for the Contract, or (iii) the supervision of the Contract, may not be awarded a Contract, unless the conflict stemming from this	We request that this clause be made applicable to the team members being proposed as part of the project. As, given the size and scale of operations of our firm, it may be difficult to confirm/ adhere to the clause.	No Changes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
5	Section 2: Instructions to Consultants and Data Sheet A. General Provisions B. Preparation of Proposals Specific Considerations Sub-clause 14.1.3 Page 11 E. Data Sheet ITC Clause Reference 14.1.3 Page 20		If stated in the Data Sheet, the Consultant shall include in its Proposal at least the same time input (in the same unit as indicated in the Data Sheet) of Key Experts, failing which the Financial Proposal will be adjusted for the purpose of comparison of proposals and decision for award in accordance with the procedure in the Data Sheet.	We understand from the Data Sheet that this Sub-clause is not applicable. Please confirm our understanding.	Yes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
----------------	---	---

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
6	Section 2: Instructions to Consultants E. Data Sheet B. Preparation of Proposals Clause 14.1.1 Page 20		Shortlisted Consultants may associate with (a) non-shortlisted consultant(s): No OR (b) other shortlisted consultant(s): No	We understand that the RFP doesn't allow for enhancing expertise by associating with other shortlisted/non-shortlisted consultants. However considering that a firm may be awarded up to 16 AMRUT cities, the empanelled firms may find it difficult to propose resources for these cities, we request that this condition be relaxed so that association with non-shortlisted consultant(s) is possible.	No Changes
7	Section 6. Terms of Reference Scope of Services /		Assess the existing VCF tools in the State	1) We understand that as part of the scope of work the consultant is required to review VCF tools used in other parts	1. Yes, ULB facilitate to provide information 2. Yes, Compare with other
8	Section 6. Terms of Reference Scope of Services / Section 7.2 (3) / Page 62 of the RfP		For each of the selected methods provide technical assistance to customize the VCF methods for the State and its ULBs.	We understand that the customization of VCF methods would be limited to the jurisdiction of identified cities and only standard draft templates would be prepared for any legal/executive order, amendments to rules/regulations applicable for the State and its other ULBs. Kindly confirm if this understanding is correct.	No Changes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
9	Section 6. Terms of Reference Scope of Services / Section 7.2 (7) / Page 63 of the RfP		For each of the suggested VCF tools, the Consulting Firm will provide handholding support for implementation of the interventions, and also support in implementing changes in laws, government orders, bye laws, etc.	We understand that our role would be to identify the required changes in laws/ government orders and bye laws etc. and support the client in drafting the recommended amendments/ revisions. The final responsibility of getting the drafts approved would be that of the client and concerned departments. Kindly confirm if this understanding is correct.	Consulting Firm will provide handholding support for implementation of the interventions, and also support in implementing changes in laws, government orders, bye laws etc. to ULB & State.

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
10	Section 6. Terms of Reference Scope of Services / Section 7.2 (8) / Page 63 of the RfP		The Consulting Firm will also broadly study projects/modules/packages in the SMART/AMRUT cities Proposals and recommend most appropriate VCF method(s) for the project which may be incorporated in the Detailed Project Reports and Financial Operation Plan of that project approved by State High Power Steering Committee (SHPS)	We understand that the client, its advisors and other concerned departments shall provide details of various infrastructure projects/ modules/ packages in the AMRUT/Smart City Proposals (including the respective DPRs and Financial Operation Plan) and their costs for the analysis. Kindly clarify if this understanding is correct.	ULB will facilitate in providing required proposal/information/documentation.

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
11	Section 6. Terms of Reference 7.3.4 Expertise and Inputs of Key Professionals Page 65 of the RfP		The Consulting firm shall provide adequate staff with appropriate qualifications and experience to undertake the works described in the TOR in given time for all cities. Consultants shall propose separate teams for carrying out the assignment considering one team for each city.	We understand that a team shall be working on multiple AMRUT cities, and not a single city. Kindly confirm our understanding.	Seperate team for each city with equilent qualification to be deputed once the contract is awarded city wise.

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
----------------	---	---

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
12	Standard Form of Contract II General Conditions of the Contract C. Obligation of the Consultant 22. Confidentiality Page 87 of the RfP		22.1 Except with the prior written consent of the Client, the Consultant and the Experts shall not at any time communicate to any person or entity any confidential information acquired in the course of the Services, nor shall the Consultant and the Experts make public the recommendations formulated in the course of, or as a result of, the Services.	We request appending the below sentence to clause 22.1 to limit the duration of confidentiality as per acceptable standards: The confidentiality obligations shall survive the termination of this Contract / completion of Services for a period of one (1) year.	No Changes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
13	. Standard Form of Contract II General Conditions of the Contract C. Obligation of the Consultant 24. Insurance to be Taken Out by the Consultant Page 87 of the RfP		24.1 The Consultant shall take out and maintain, and shall cause any Sub-consultants to take out and maintain, and its (or the Sub-consultants', as the case may be) own cost but on terms approved by the Client...	We would like to clarify that Deloitte subscribes to a firm level indemnity insurance policy to cover for our engagements with various Clients at Deloitte's terms and conditions. This is a standard practice being adopted by consulting firms in the country and globally and acceptable to Government Clients in India. We therefore request that the phrase "but on the terms approved by the Client" to be deleted.	No Changes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
14	Standard Form of Contract II General Conditions of the Contract C. Obligation of the Consultant 25. Accounting, Inspection and Auditing Page 88 of the RfP		25.2 The Consultant shall permit and shall cause its Sub-consultants to permit, the Bank and/or persons appointed by the Bank to inspect the Site and/or all accounts and records relating to the performance of the Contract and the submission of the Proposal to provide the Services, and to have such accounts and records audited by auditors appointed by the Bank if requested by the Bank....	We would like to clarify that the Client may audit / inspect documents and information maintained for the specific purposes of the Contract. Further, we would like to clarify that as a policy Deloitte does not allow Clients or other stakeholders to inspect its office and accounts as it contains confidential information pertaining to projects that Deloitte assists various clients with and may constitute a breach of confidentiality.	Yes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
15	Standard Form of Contract II General Conditions of the Contract C. Obligation of the Consultant 27. Proprietary Rights of the Client in Reports and Records Page 88 of the RfP		27.1 Unless otherwise stated in the SCC, all reports and relevant data and information such as maps, diagrams, plans, databases, other documents and software, supporting records or material compiled or prepared by the Consultant for the Client in the course of the Services shall be confidential and become and remain the absolute property of the Client.	We would like to clarify that any pre-existing Intellectual Property Rights (IPR) of Deloitte (on elements such as methodology, tools, techniques and databases exclusive to Deloitte) shall remain with Deloitte. We request you to kindly add the below sentence to clause 27.1: “Any pre-existing Intellectual Property Rights (IPR) of the Consultant (on elements such as methodology, tools, techniques and databases exclusive to Deloitte) used during the course of the Services shall remain with the Consultant”.	No Changes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarification	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
16	Standard Form of Contract II Special Conditions of the Contract 41.2 Page 101 of the RfP		Payment Arrangement The payment will be city linked. The Contract Price will be averaged out for each city by dividing the total contract price by the number of cities under this assignment.	We understand that we need to submit a separate Financial Proposal for each city. The payment for a city shall be based on the quote prepared for that specific city. Kindly clarify this understanding.	Yes

Project Name: Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

RFP No.	RFP No. : CBUD/AMRUT/61/ Uttar Pradesh	Pre-Bid Meeting held on 24 May, 2017
---------	--	--------------------------------------

Selection of Consulting Services for providing Technical Assistance to Selected Cities in generating revenue through Value Capture Financing Tools for Smart City Development

S.No	RFQ Clause No.	Page No.	Content of RFQ requiring Clarificaiton	Clarification / Suggestion / Changes sought	RFP Ammended/Clarification
------	----------------	----------	--	---	----------------------------

Others

1	III. Special Conditions of Contract 41.2 clause		The payment will be city linked. The Contract Price will be averaged out for each city by dividing the total contract price by the number of cities under this assignment.		Not Applicable
---	---	--	--	--	----------------